A couple dozen members of Ironworkers #512 and Operating Engineers #49 worked all of Saturday, Oct. 14 erecting Bentleyville’s 12-story Christmas tree as they do every year to help bring the joy of the holidays to thousands of families from Nov. 18 to Dec. 26. The union members will be back to help bring the joy of the holidays to thousands of families that started with the first screenings and endorsements five and half months ago on May 11 comes to a close. Working families have had a majority of friends on both the city council and school board. Nov. 7 will tell if that continues and it will if working families get to the polls and vote for Labor-endorsed candidates and the referendum.

CITY COUNCIL
At-large city councilors Barb Russ and Zack Filipovich are both Labor-endorsed in their re-election bids. As hard as it is to always agree on the issues these two councilors have an incredible record of votes that protect and support working families.

As North East Area Labor Council President Alan Netland is wont to say in political discussions, “Can you tell me a vote where they haven’t sided with us?”

A good reason for that is that they are frequent guests at Central Body monthly meetings and other labor events. That helps them “get it,” and can help voters understand why some other candidates don’t “get it.”

When she was a member of the St. Louis County Attorney’s office Russ was instrumental in organizing her co-workers into AFSCME Local 3761.

Filipovich always identifies himself as a former member of UFCW Local 1116 (now 1189).

The same can be said for Labor-endorsed Renee Van Nett, who is hoping to become an elected official for the first time as a city councilor from District 4, which covers the West End, Piedmont and Duluth Heights. She faces a tough challenge to beat an incumbent, who has been changing his positions depending on how he feels the mood of voters is changing. At one time he was contending he was in lock step with labor’s issues and now you’d be hard pressed to find him on the side of organized labor on just about any issue.

“She has learned a lot,” said Central Body President Beth McCuskey about Van Nett’s being involved in the community.

The daughter of a member of Ironworkers Local 512, Van Nett organized her co-workers at American Indian Community Housing with AFSCME Local 3558.

All three Labor-endorsed councilors survived the Sept. 12 Primary Election and all were the top vote getters in their contests. That doesn’t make anyone comfortable about the General Election, which will have considerably higher turnout and fewer candidates for voters to chose from.

SCHOOL BOARD
This is a very exciting year for supporters of Labor-endorsed candidates running for the Duluth School Board. After years of conflict created by a couple members on virtually everything that came before the board, some very qualified candidates stepped up to say “that’s enough” and filed for election.

For the at-large board seats
**Forum will help you understand healthcare**

The delivery of health care in America is very difficult for even healthy people to navigate. It can be a nightmare for people with illnesses, even leading to bankruptcy for many with insurance. It is not getting any easier to understand.

A free and open forum at Peace United Church of Christ, 1111 N. 11th Ave. E. in Duluth Sat., Nov. 18, 9 AM noon may help consumers understand our system better. 

**Healthcare 2017 The Basics: Understanding Healthcare Choices and Changes is presented by Organizing for Action-Duluth, Northland Healthcare Alliance, and the League of Women Voters will bring together three speakers to address health care.

Dr. Patrick Schoenfelder is a retired Diagnostic Radiologist who worked in private practice and in large multi-specialty groups. In his retirement he has developed an interest in studying health care in the U.S. and other countries. He will address "The American Healthcare System: What do we want, and what do we have?"

State Rep. Jennifer Schultz is a PhD in Health Economics and Professor in the Dept. of Economics at the University of Minnesota, Duluth. She is working for affordable access to healthcare in the legislature. Her topic is "The Economics of American Healthcare."

Michael J. Mahoney is Vice President for Public Policy at the Essentia Health System in Duluth. His topic is "Understanding the Legislative Process: Normal Procedure vs Reconciliation."

---

**Life After Hate author at UMD**

In his youth Christian Picciolini was an active member of a violent Neo-Nazi organization. After leaving the group, he worked to change his life. He earned a degree in International Relations from DePaul University. In 2011, he co-founded the nonprofit organization Life After Hate which is dedicated to helping people leave hate groups, especially white supremacy groups. Picciolini will speak about his experiences on Weds., Nov. 8, at 7 pm in Kirby Ballroom at UMD.

In 2015, Picciolini published the book *Romantic Violence: Memoirs of an American Skinhead*. He won an Emmy in 2016 for directing and producing ExitUSA's PSA “There is life after hate.” He was appointed United Nations-affiliated ambassador for iChangeNations and was honored with a National Statesman award. He is an associate for the University of Southern California Price ‘Homegrown Violent Extremism’ program and has worked as an adjunct professor at the college level. In 2017, he founded EXIT Solutions, a global network of former extremists helping people disengage from hate and violent ideologies.

The free/open event is hosted by the UMD College of Liberal Arts Change Team, one of many campus climate “units” promoting practices of “inclusivity, equity, and respect” as part of a campus-wide effort to create “a positive and inclusive campus climate for all by advancing equity, diversity and social justice.”

---

**Right to work training II/9**

A second training to educate and organize union members on right to work (RTW) that is decimating unions around the country will be held at the Duluth Labor Temple on Thursday, Nov. 9 from 5 to 7 pm prior to the monthly Central Body meeting.

Right to work (for less) is being pushed nationally, has passed in 28 states, and is being brought up in local units of government. The Minnesota AFL-CIO is training statewide prior to 2018’s huge election year. Misnamed right to work laws allow private sector workers to get the benefits of union contracts without sharing the costs through union dues. In the public sector “fair share” allows workers to get the benefits without paying for them in “open shops.” RTW is the vehicle anti-union forces use to undermine unions, destroying their funding, while still forcing them to service non-dues paying members. Minnesota is surrounded by RTW states.

Todd Dahlstrom, Minnesota AFL-CIO Organizing/Growth Director, led the first training here August 24. He said learning to map work sites is important so unions know who their best activists are. Internal organizing is key to educating members. “We can talk to our co-workers, which is unique to unions,” Dahlstrom said. “We have access to our people and we have contracts.”

A 24-page “Internal Organizing Toolkit: A Resource for Building Stronger Local Unions” can guide unions in the process and they will be available at the training.

“We need to get as many of our members across every sector to attend these trainings so we’re all prepared because we know right to work for less may be knocking at our door,” said North East Area Labor Council Field Organizer Katie Humphrey.

Not only are conservative, anti-union groups like the American Legislative Exchange Council and the National Right to Work Foundation coaching Republican elected officials on how to bring RTW bills forward, court cases, including *Janus v. AFSCME* in the U.S. Supreme Court, have unions in crosshairs.

Dahlstrom said the training and organizing can’t stop, that everyone has a lot to learn from each other. At one time unions tried to stand alone to protect their turf. Those days are over.

“Now we need to network because they’re coming after all of us,” Dahlstrom warned.

To register for the Nov. 9 training contact Katie Humphrey at katie@nealc.org or by calling 218-370-0187.
We haven’t lived in Duluth for half a century but that’s still our hometown so we should be able to comment on the 1st city on the unshelled sea. Hell, everyone else does even if it ain’t home to them either. I’ve lived on the same county road since 1973. When I first moved there it was a dirt road our township graded. It was a fairly good road until the spring when four huge frost boils would appear. School buses occasionally got stuck in them. In the summer it was oiled but it still generated a lot of dust. It got blacktopped in 1986, which was really great. That’s a long time ago and it has deteriorated badly since then. Thanks to the St. Louis County Transportation Sales Tax it got rebuilt this summer and blacktopped two weeks ago. The amount of work that went into preparing the subgrade was impressive. I can’t imagine Ulland Bros. and the subgrade was impressive. I couldn’t imagine Ulland Bros. and the subgrade was impressive.

The amount of time ago and it has deteriorated badly since then. Thanks to the St. Louis County Transportation Sales Tax it got rebuilt this summer and blacktopped two weeks ago. The amount of work that went into preparing the subgrade was impressive. I can’t imagine Ulland Bros. and the subgrade was impressive. I couldn’t imagine Ulland Bros. and the subgrade was impressive.

...
A warning from Iowa
...from page 1

sue for medical malpractice
or asbestos; defunded Planned
Parenthood; and made deep
cuts in services.

“This group of Republican
bandits has taken a $950 mil-
lion surplus seven years ago
and turned into $350 million
deficit,” Homan says.

Back in 2016, Homan
expected bad news was coming
as soon as he heard the election
results: “I knew at 3 o’clock in
the morning we were screwed.
I believed they would do to us
what they did in Wisconsin:
This is Wisconsin on steroids.”

But Homan and Council 61
refused to quit.

“I get up and do a job I thor-
oughly love and do a job where
I fight for people, some of
whom can’t fight for them-
selves,” he says. “That’s what
all of you do. I’m going to fight
every day of my life until I
retire to get those rights back
for my membership.”

Council 61 had learned by
watching what happened when
Gov. Scott Walker set out to
destroy unions in Wisconsin.

“All we got by taking con-
trol of that state Capitol is we
got smelly,” Homan says. “We
couldn’t win the fight
that way.”

Homan directed
workers and leaders
to extend every con-
tract they could: They
succeeded with all
but 15.

Instead of holding
massive rallies, mem-
bers took legislators on
where they live in their home commu-
nities. They packed town hall
meetings with 200 to 300 peo-
ple confronting Republican
legislators and supporting
Democrats who had supported
them. Council 61 figured out
how to let members pay dues
by credit card.

Homan, who routinely
holds 90 town hall meetings a
year with members, continued
doing so, but used the time to
warn them about what was
coming and to listen. The state
contract, which was a book a
year ago, is now down to a sin-
gle page plus a lot of job classi-
fications. Yet Council 61
signed back up 5,500 members,
and more than 2,000 are now MVPs (strong contributors to
the political action committee).

“The employer cannot take
your union away from you,”
Homan says. “Only you can
give it up. I’ll be goddamned if
I’m giving up my union. I don’t
want your pity. In Iowa, we are
going to kick their ass in
November. We are going to
take charge of our state.”

He challenged AFSCME
Council 5 members to talk to
feepayers and other members,
and to turn out in force next
November to vote.

“If you lose your next gov-
ernor’s election and your
House and Senate maintain the
same makeup, you will have
this bill here in Minnesota. I
don’t want that for anybody,”
he says. “The only way we’re
going to survive is if we lock
arms and say, Screw them.
We’re going to fight, and we’re
going to be here, and we’re
going to continue to support
our union.”

Homan left Duluth for the
Oregon AFL-CIO convention
with this message. “I’m here to
tell you to get off your ass and
get engaged and do the work so
that this doesn’t happen here,”
the Northwest Labor Press
quoted him as saying.

The Duluth Building & Construction Trades Council gave the Head of the Lakes United Way Campaign a great boost
Oct. 17 with a check for $15,800.11, proceeds from their golf fundraiser. It was $2,000 more than their previous high
total from 2016. In its 27th year, the effort has generated over a quarter million of dollars that has been all given to
diabetes research and now, exclusively, to HLUW to distribute to agencies and programs for those in need.
After shutting down Enbridge pipeline projects in south Superior this summer by chaining themselves to equipment, getting arrested and other tactics, protestors took it to another level Oct. 16 by forcing Administrative Law Judge Ann O’Reilly to end a public hearing on Enbridge’s Line 3 Replacement Project at the DECC. Two packed sessions were held. The afternoon session found Enbridge asking their employees to adjourn to an overflow room to allow speakers, chosen by chance if they hadn’t already spoken, an opportunity to address the hearing. The evening session found pipeline protestors wanting to speak again and they disrupted the hearing causing O’Reilly to end it.

The day began with the state Department of Commerce’s Deputy Commissioner Bill Grant again stating their belief that the pipeline is not needed. O’Reilly will continue to take comment on the proposed replacement of the 50-year old Line 3 until she presents her findings to the Public Utilities Commission in February. PUC will have until April to make their decision.

The proposed Line 3 could bring 760,000 barrels a day of Alberta crude to Superior, Wisconsin. Supporters of Enbridge’s plan were again out in force at the Oct. 16 hearing to say pipelines are by far the safest and most environmentally sound way to transport oil. Not only are pipelines far safer than trains, trucks, or maritime shipping, they also guarantee a reliable flow.

Dan Olson, International Representative for the Laborers Union, spends a lot of time testifying at hearings. He told O’Reilly and the panel that the Canadian crude supply has customers waiting along the pipeline at two refineries in Minnesota and Superior’s Husky refinery.

“I stated that as a measure of national security we should utilize North American crude oil from Canada,” Olson said. That is far better than getting it from any one of 70 countries that sell crude here but who may not be our allies. He took exception to the Dept. of Commerce position that there is no need for Line 3.

“That’s not true, there are hundreds of products made from oil that we use every day here in the Twin Ports,” Olson said. He said opponents, like Friends of the Boundary Waters, just don’t want energy projects in their back yard.

“They offered an alternate route that would take the oil down towards the Twin Cities and end up at a Koch Refinery in Lakeville (MN),” Olson said. “I wholeheartedly support the replacement and relocation of Line 3. It will also put close to 1,000 Laborers to work for a year.”

Energy transportation projects such as Line 3 replacement will provide family-sustaining construction jobs to more than 1,500 Minnesotans during the course of the project. These projects will provide new business opportunities for contractors for design, survey, environmental assessment, and project planning and ongoing positions in safety, monitoring and maintenance. Replacing Line 3 will provide a huge boost to Minnesota's economy. In 2011 alone, Enbridge paid more than $34 million in property taxes to the state. Enbridge is projected to spend $2.1 billion in Minnesota on Line 3.

Public comments on Enbridge’s Line 3 Replacement Project will be taken until 4:30 p.m., Weds., Nov. 22. Make sure to include docket numbers 14-196 or 15-137 when making comments:

mm.gov/puc/line3/participate/comment or publicadvisor. puc@state.mn.us. They can be faxed to 651-297-7073 or mailed to Scott Ek, Minnesota Public Utilities Commission, 121 Seventh Place East, Suite 350, St. Paul, MN 55101.


Free Consultation • No Recovery, No Fee

STOCKMAN LAW OFFICE

Office 218.576.8599
Anytime 218.393.5239

stockmaninjurylaw@gmail.com
www.stockmaninjurylaw.com

When you look close, your union benefits are clear

It’s nearly year-end – use your union eye care benefits

We bill for your union benefits
Eye exams for you and your family
Glasses, safety glasses, contacts
Brand names: Oakley, Wiley X, and more!

Vision-Pro OPTICAL

Be — and be seen

Aurora | Cloquet | Duluth Kenwood | Grand Rapids | Hinckley | Moose Lake | Superior | Two Harbors | West Duluth

visionprooptical.com

LABOR WORLD NEWS, WEDNESDAY, OCTOBER 25, 2017
Central Body resolution seeks release of AFL-CIO’s AIFLD documents

Following a presentation by Rob McKenzie at their Sept. 14 meeting, delegates to the Duluth Local Labor Body passed a resolution calling on the national AFL-CIO to release its sealed documents on its history with the American Institute for Free Labor Development (AIFLD).

McKenzie is a retired St. Paul Ford plant worker who became a United Auto Workers (UAW) International Representative and an activist in the Minnesota labor movement before retiring in early 2016.

“I began researching something that has bothered me for 20 years,” he said. “In January 1990 a group of about 300 armed thugs attacked and shot workers in the Mexico City Ford Assembly Plant who had engaged in a work stoppage a few days earlier. When they returned to work the thugs were inside the plant, a confrontation occurred and twelve workers were wounded and one died. Our UAW local did support work for them and brought a couple of the fired leaders in for a meeting with the supportive St. Paul UAW Local 879.

In 1996 an AFL-CIO staff person told McKenzie that AIFLD had been involved in the case. In 1995 John Sweeney was elected president of the AFL-CIO in the first contested election for the position in federation history. He defeated Thomas R. Donahue, who had been secretary-treasurer to retiring President Lane Kirkland. Kirkland retired early to give Donahue a leg up in the expected contested election at the convention in New York City.

AIFLD was created in the early 1960s by the AFL-CIO supposedly for labor solidarity work in the Western Hemisphere. Many U.S. union labor leaders in that cold war era were hard core anti-communists. AIFLD accepted a lot of its funding from the U.S. State Dept.’s United States Agency for International Development and later the National Endowment for Democracy.

In her 1992 book Workers of the World Undermined: American Labor’s Role in U.S. Foreign Policy Beth Sims’ main thesis was that AFL-CIO foreign policy sided with pro-business unions abroad rather than helping exploited Third World workers. She revealed over 60 departments and institutes in global labor and government organizations that she said were undermining workers’ organizing. Yet President Ronald Reagan drew great praise for his support of Poland’s Lech Walesa and the Solidarnosc movement as he was leading the charge against communism in America.

“AIFLD had a bad reputation in the UAW,” McKenzie said. “Victor Ruether had criticized AIFLD in the 1960s for working closely with the CIA in Latin America.”

There were a number of published stories about the AFL-CIO/State Dept. complicity in the 1990s into the early 2000s but you are hard pressed to find anything about it in an Internet search today.

Sweeney apparently knew the history and shortly after taking office after his 1995 victory he merged three federation departments into the American Center for International Labor Solidarity. “I have been to a fight against communism that had cooled but its history is sealed at the University of Maryland archives.

McKenzie has made numerous requests to the AFL-CIO and the University of Maryland to have the archives made available with no success.

“I was told in June 2016 that my request was being processed but it never happened and now I get no response to my requests,” said McKenzie. “It has turned into a long and complicated story that started with my desire to seek some justice and resolution on the story about those Mexican Ford workers.”

A few weeks ago he contacted the University of Maryland directly and learned that the AFL-CIO had refused the University permission to open the AIFLD records he had requested. He hopes pressure from labor bodies will change their mind.

Central Body delegates were grim faced in hearing and discussing McKenzie’s story. Some expressed concern over a bad light that could be shed on the AFL-CIO at a time when labor is struggling. But when the resolution came to a vote it passed without opposition on the premise that truth needs to have light shed on it.

McKenzie has been trying to get other labor bodies to pass resolutions, and was pleased when he learned that Duluth had been the first. The St. Paul Regional Labor Federation may take up the resolution at their November meeting.

The delay tactics he has experienced have been frustrating for McKenzie, who has been working tirelessly on the project, even taking Spanish lessons in hopes of finally getting and reading a 1992 Mexican Human Rights Commission Report on the incident. He is also auditing a Modern Mexican History class at the University of Minnesota.

“I have not been able to contact any of the officers or activists in Mexico who were involved in this,” he said. “They had no idea of AIFLD involvement at the time.”

Few do, but McKenzie will keep looking for the answers.

“I have had a Freedom of Information Request in now for over a year and hope to get State Department documents in a few weeks,” he said. “I know there are some because I have a fax Wellstone sent on it.” As Minnesota’s U.S. Senator Paul Wellstone had met with the Mexican union officials who visited his office.

His work on the incident is occurring as U.S., Canadian, and Mexican trade representatives are renegotiating the North American Free Trade Agreement. NAFTA has proven to be a job killer in all three countries. Many U.S. and foreign automakers have moved production to Mexico because it is close to American consumers. Mexican autoworkers have seen their wages cut to just over $2 an hour as they assemble vehicles they could never hope to own, which NAFTA supporters said would happen.

U.S. Senator Paul Wellstone met with two of the fired Mexican autoworker union’s executive committee in 1992 when they visited with the supportive St. Paul UAW Local 879. (Photo courtesy Laney/McMahon)
Voted Labor
Nov. 7...from page 1

worked in all the district's schools and has seen all the challenges students and the district face. He said there is much to be proud of about the district but those things don't get enough play because of all the controversy.

In District 1 Rosie Loeffler-Kemp is the only Labor-endorsed incumbent running for re-election. She has impeccable credentials not only in her four years on the board but as an engaged parent of public school students for the 23 years she has lived in Duluth.

She is a tireless campaigner and works just as hard for other Labor-endorsed candidates as she does.

When recently retired Duluth Federation of Teachers member Jill Lofald announced she was running for western Duluth's District 4 school board seat it created a buzz that hasn't stopped. That district has been represented by one of the worst school board members in memory.

Lofald has always lived in that district, taught at Denfeld for 31 years, where her husband, Roger, is an AFSCME 66 member as a Para-Professional. Their children have all attended those western public schools and Lofald says her grandchildren will too. It’s pretty difficult to beat that but when you listen to her passion for the district and Duluth Public Schools she has lived in Duluth.

Voting information for Nov. 7

All elections are important as they determine how government will improve our lives, or not, depending on who gets elected. The candidates in the box on page one have been endorsed by the Duluth Central Labor Body and some of them will appear on your ballot, but not all of them.

You need to be a registered voter in order to vote on Tuesday, Nov. 7. If you have voted within the last four years AND NOT MOVED you are already registered. It is too late to pre-register to vote. You can register at your polling place on election day by using any of the following proof of residence options:

Option 1: Valid Minnesota driver's license or learner's permit, Minnesota ID card, or a receipt for any of these, Tribal ID card with your name, address, photo & signature.

Option 2: Photo ID plus a document with current name and address. The ID can be expired, and the document can also be shown electronically on a device (smartphone, etc.).

Option 3: Driver's license, state ID card or learner's permit issued by any state • United States passport • United States Military ID card • Tribal ID card with the name, signature and photo of the voter • Minnesota university, college or technical college ID card • Minnesota high school ID card

Accepted documents: • Residential lease or rental agreement (must be valid through Election Day) • Current student fee statement • Bill, account or service statement due or dated within 30 days of election day for: Phone (landline, cell, VOIP, etc.), TV (cable, satellite, etc.), Internet services, Solid waste/sewer services, Electric, gas or water, Banking or credit card, Rent or mortgage payments

Option 4: A registered voter from your precinct can go with you to the polling place to sign an oath confirming your name and address. A registered voter can vouch for up to eight others.

Option 5: College students can use a student photo ID card if their college provided a student housing list to election officials.

Option 6: If you were previously registered in the precinct but changed names or moved within the same precinct, you only need to tell the elections official your previous name or address — no additional documentation is needed.

Option 7: If you pre-registered to vote too close to Election Day, you may have received a Notice of Late Registration in the mail. This notice can be used to register.

Extended hours for walk-in absentee voting - Saturday, November 4, 2017 (10:00 a.m. to 3:00 p.m.) and Monday, November 6, 2017 (8:00 a.m. to 5:00 p.m.), which is the last day for absentee voting.

For where to vote, the State of Minnesota Precinct Finder at http://pollfinder.sos.state.mn.us will find your location.
By David Sobelsohn
Supreme Court Correspondent
PAI News Service

WASHINGTON—A case argued before the Supreme Court October 3, Gill v. Whitford, could have profound ramifications not only for American workers, but for the future of American democracy.

In 2011, for the first time in over 40 years, Wisconsin Republicans controlled the governor’s office and both houses of the legislature. Armed with the 2010 census, sophisticated metrics, and the latest computers, the Republicans—secretly set about redrawing legislative districts.

They rejected one map after another as too balanced, too fair to Democrats. Finally, by packing most Democratic voters into just a few districts, and by scattering other Democrats into minority-Republican districts, the Republicans drew the most partisan map possible. It worked. In the 2012 election, though most Wisconsin voters voted for Democratic candidates for the State Assembly, Republicans seized 60 of its 99 seats.

Republican legislative domination had a calamitous effect on workers’ rights. In 2015, the Wisconsin legislature enacted so-called “right to work” legislation, letting union nonmembers use union services—collective bargaining and grievance settlement—without paying for them, denying unions money they need for such services.

Then, in 2017, the legislature prohibited Wisconsin local governments from requiring their contractors to hire union workers, banning Project Labor Agreements on taxpayere-funded construction.

Predictably, Wisconsin unions have suffered a precipitous drop in membership, to 8.1 percent of the state’s workforce—a drop of 40% in just ten years. Membership dues have fallen nearly 50 percent.

How could the U.S. Constitution permit this? In 1964, in its famous one-person, one-vote case, the Supreme Court recognized voting as a fundamental right and found vote dilution a violation of the 14th Amendment. In 1976, the Supreme Court declared it a 1st Amendment violation for a state to discriminate, in public employment, on the basis of political affiliation.

Logically, if it’s unconstitutional to discriminate on the basis of political party, and if voting is a fundamental right, it should violate the Constitution to dilute the right to vote on the basis of political party. But as Justice Oliver Wendell Holmes once wrote, “a page of history is worth a volume of logic.”

Gerrymandering—in which, in effect, representatives choose their voters, instead of the other way around—dates back at least to 1788.

In 1812, a Massachusetts redistricting map, signed into law by Gov. Elbridge Gerry, so distorted one district’s borders that, on the map, the district resembled a salamander. That inspired a Boston newspaper to call the term “gerrymander.”

Today, 37 state legislatures still draw their own district lines. Historically, convinced they couldn’t devise a “judicially manageable standard,” U.S. courts have refused to overturn district maps approved by a state legislature.

But history proves only so much. The 19th century knew nothing of deep data-mining and high-speed computers. Under Wisconsin’s current map, the legislature could have a large Republican majority for generations—even if Wisconsin voters repeatedly voted for Democrats, as they did in 2012.

At oral argument, several justices expressed alarm at the prospect of a persistent extreme disparity between the party voters support and the party elected to a legislative majority. As Justice Ruth Bader Ginsburg asked, what becomes of our “precious right to vote” if election results are “preordained”?

Wisconsin Solicitor General Misha Tseytlin, and Erin Murphy, representing the state senate, both claimed the Supreme Court has no “workable standard” to identify unconstitutional gerrymanders. But both attorneys, responding to a question from Justice Anthony Kennedy—whose vote likely will determine the outcome—conceded state law couldn’t blatantly require district lines to advantage one particular party. If so, as Justice Elena Kagan pointed out, it’s just a question of intent. Courts frequently look for legislative intent—what lawmakers wanted to accomplish—beyond the words of a law.

To Chief Justice John Roberts’s concern about a flood of legal challenges, Justice Stephen Breyer proposed an easily applied requirement to cause most cases’ quick dismissal: As in Wisconsin, did one political party control the entire reapportionment process?

Justice Sotomayor added that, in the Wisconsin case, every proposed test points in the same direction: This was the most extreme map they could make.

Paul Smith, the attorney for the Democratic voters who challenged Wisconsin’s map, added if the Supreme Court approves this district map, after the 2020 census “you’re going to have a festival of copycat gerrymandering” so extreme that it “effectively nullifies democracy.”

A decision is expected by spring of 2018.